**The Minutes of the Meeting for Health-related Organizations**

**“Mining Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”**

Meeting on Wednesday, 27th October 2010 at 3pm

Meeting place: Meeting room, VSO Offices, “Bolor” Business Center, Ulaanbaatar

Meeting time: 3:00 – 5:00 pm

Discussion topic: **“Mining Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”**

Chairperson: Dr. Odontsetseg Brown, Coordinator for HROs’ monthly regular

forums

Speakers & David Jacobstein, Team Advisor, Pact Mongolia

Presentations: Oyu Tolgoi Community Health, Safety & Security Programme Consultancy Project

“Khukh Tenger Khugjil Konsortsium Oyu Tolgoi Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”

**Agenda**

1. Record those attending
2. Apologies for absence
3. Minutes for the meeting held on September 29, 2010, on “Air Quality and Human Health”
4. Matters arising from the Minutes
5. “Secretary’s report” (any correspondence or other communications)
6. Agenda items:

**“Mining Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”**

7 Any Other Business

8 Date and time of the next meeting

Item 1

**Those present:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | **Name** | **Position & Organization** | **Email & Telephone** |
| 1 | Odontsetseg Brown | Coordinator, HROs monthly regular forums | [odnoo1220@yahoo.com](mailto:odnoo1220@yahoo.com)  99149656, 329267 |
| 2 | Bolormaa Purev | Executive Director, Mongolian Public Health Professionals’ Association | [mphpa.mongolia@gmail.com](mailto:mphpa.mongolia@gmail.com)  96962780 |
| 3 | David Jacobstein | Team Advisor, Pact Mongolia | 95050873 |
| 4 | Jalkhaa Kupul | Public Health Consultant, Public Health Institute | [kupuljalkhaa@yahoo.com](mailto:kupuljalkhaa@yahoo.com)  99273009, 451911 |
| 5 | Amgalanzaya.Ts | SPH Project8 NLM-Mongolia | [zaya@nlmmon.org](mailto:zaya@nlmmon.org)  [amaraa@nlmmon.org](mailto:amaraa@nlmmon.org)  99256924, 682425 |
| 6 | Indermohan Narula | Country Director, VSO Mongolia  ADB | [indermohan.narula@vsoint.org](mailto:indermohan.narula@vsoint.org)  [indermohan.narula@gmail.com](mailto:indermohan.narula@gmail.com)  99119512, 318514 |
| 7 | Beth Campbell | VSO | [bethcampbell337@hotmail.com](mailto:bethcampbell337@hotmail.com)  95042022 |
| 8 | Oyunzul.N | Pediatrician, Songinokhairkhan District Health Center | [zulaa\_us@yahoo.com](mailto:zulaa_us@yahoo.com)  99174216 |
| 9 | Amar | VSO Program Manager | [amar.purev@vsoint.org](mailto:amar.purev@vsoint.org)  99024406 |
| 10 | Altanzagas Badrakh | National Air Quality Office | [baltanzagas@yahoo.com](mailto:baltanzagas@yahoo.com)  99154959 |
| 11 | Yanjaa | Project Coordinator, Mongolian Public Health Professionals’ Association | 99172350, 325190 |
| 12 | Nancy Nix | University of Alaska Anchorage Assistant Professor | [afnan@vaa.alaska.edu](mailto:afnan@vaa.alaska.edu)  US (907) 986-6590 |
| 13 | Curt Madison | University of Maine Director of Distance Education | [curt.madison@maine.edu](mailto:curt.madison@maine.edu)  (907) 988-8156 |
| 14 | Emilie Indunan-Bolhayon | UB City Health Department, Health Educator / VSO Volunteer | [emdn19@yahoo.com](mailto:emdn19@yahoo.com)  95042022 |
| 15 | Batbileg.B | Press Representative, Mongolian National Mining Association | [bilgee@mining-mongolia.mn](mailto:bilgee@mining-mongolia.mn)  99095791  314877 |
| 16 | Tia Farrell | Peace Corps-Chair, HIV/AIDS/STI Task Force  MRCS International Volunteer, HIV/AIDS Programme | [tia\_farrell@redcross.mn](mailto:tia_farrell@redcross.mn)  95715714 |
| 17 | Siilegmaa | Peace Corps Health Programs | 99101425 |
| 18 | Oyunchimeg.S | Project Coordinator, Mongolian Employer’s Federation | [oyunchimegsodnom@yahoo.com](mailto:oyunchimegsodnom@yahoo.com)  326445, 99191336 |
| 19 | Travis Hellstrom | Peace Corps / WHO | [travishellstrom@gmail.com](mailto:travishellstrom@gmail.com) |
| 20 | Enkhtuya Palam | Vice Director, Public Health Institute | [p\_enkhee2001@yahoo.com](mailto:p_enkhee2001@yahoo.com)  99290496, 450770 |
| 21 | Battsetseg Ulziikhuu | Pact Mongolia | battsetsegu@yahoo.com, [bulziikhuu@pactworld.org](mailto:bulziikhuu@pactworld.org)  96600796, 452923 |

**Item 2**

**Apologies for absence**

Apologies for absence were received from:

1. Dr. Oyunbileg, Director, Public Health Institute
2. Zorigtbaatar.D, Health Programs, Peace Corps Mongolia
3. Suvd, Researcher, Public Health Institute

**Item 3**

**Minutes for September 29th 2010 meeting**

The minutes for September 29th 2010 meeting on “Air Quality and Human Health” were distributed at the meeting, and were approved by the meeting participants.

**Item 4**

**Matters arising from the minutes**

There were no matters arising from the September 2010 meeting minutes.

**Item 5**

**“Secretary’s report” / Correspondence (any communications)**

The secretary informed the meeting that the PHI had requested that “Non-communicable Diseases” should be included as one of the future meeting topics, because:

1. Non-communicable diseases’ prevalence in morbidity and mortality
2. They would like to introduce the findings, results and conclusions of the recent nationwide STEPs survey on risk factors of non-communicable diseases

**Item 6**

**Matters for discussion** (such as proposals, or reports on ongoing projects)

“Mining Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”

Speaker & Presentation: **David Jacobstein**,

Team Advisor, Pact Mongolia

Oyu Tolgoi Community Health,

Safety & Security Programme Consultancy Project

“Khukh Tenger Khugjil Konsortsium Oyu Tolgoi Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”

This presentation in English will soon be posted on the website at [www.mongolhealthnetwork.org](http://www.mongolhealthnetwork.org)

***See addendum at the end of these Minutes for notes on these presentations.***

**Item 8**

**Any Other Business**

The following topics were proposed for future meetings, presented to the meeting participants, and provisionally approved:

December 2010 - NO MEETING *(Christmas and New Year)*

January 2011 – Open meeting. *We welcome YOUR input!*

February 2011 – NO MEETING *(Tsagaan Sar)*

March 2011 - Mental Health

April 2011 – Extreme Weather and Human

May 2011 - Open meeting. *We welcome YOUR input!*

June 2011 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

July 2011 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

August 2011 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

September 2011 – Health Sector Coordination

October 2011 – Disaster Management

November 2011 - Open meeting. *We welcome YOUR input!*

December 2011 - NO MEETING *(Christmas and New Year)*

January 2012 - Health Sector’s Respond to the Dzud

February 2012 - NO MEETING *(Tsagaan Sar)*

March 2012 - Nursing Development

April 2012 – Open meeting. *We welcome YOUR input!*

May 2012 - Injuries

June 2012 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

July 2012 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

August 2012 - NO MEETING *(Summer holiday)*

September 2012 - Health Insurance System in Mongolia

October 2012 - Cardiovascular Diseases

**Item 9**

Date and time of the next meeting 3:00 - 5:00 pm

November 24th, Wednesday

VSO Meeting Room

Topic of the next meeting: Water Quality and Water-borne Diseases

**Addendum to Minutes**

**THE FULL POWERPOINT PRESENTATION FROM THE MEETING will SOON be POSTED ON THE** [**www.mongolhealthnetwork.org**](http://www.mongolhealthnetwork.org) **WEBSITE**

**Key messages delivered by the speaker:**

*“Khukh Tenger Khugjil Konsortsium Oyu Tolgoi Health Impact Assessment and Mitigation”*

**Oyu Tolgoi mine (Mongolia)**

* Location**:** Oyu Tolgoi, Umnugobi aimag
* Country: Mongolia
* Company Owner Ivanhoe Mines Mongolia Inc [www.ivanhoemines.com](http://www.ivanhoemines.com)
* The **Oyu Tolgoi mine** *(****Turquoise Hill****)* is a combined open cast mine and underground mining project in Khanbogd soum *(sub-province)* within the south Gobi Desert, approximately 235 kilometres (146 mi) east of the Umnugobi Province capital Dalanzadgad.
* The site was discovered in 2001 and is being developed as a joint venture between Ivanhoe Mines, Rio Tinto and the Government of Mongolia. The mine is under construction as of 2010 and is scheduled to begin production in 2013.

**South Gobi Province Socio –economic & Environmental Baseline Studies**

* Khanbogd citizens’ water perceptions study – July 2007
* OT employee housing options analysis – Sept 2007
* OT influx risk analysis – Sept 2007
* Umnugovi Aimag Social, Economic and Environmental Baseline Study – Jan 2009
* OT Social, Economic and Environmental Baseline Subset – May 2009
* OT Socio-Economic Impact Assessment (SIA) – Sept 2009
* OT first 5-year SEMP – Oct 2009
* OT Risk Review and Risk Register – first in 2007 and updated in 2009
* OT Technical Evaluation Group review – first in 2007 and updated in 2009

**Planned Programs, 2010**

* Local Business & Economic Development
* Local & Regional Planning and Infrastructure
* Community Health, Safety & Security Management Plan
* Community Cultural Heritage Management System
* Participatory Environmental Monitoring

**What is the Khukh Tenger Khugjil Konsortsium (KTKK)?**

* KTKK was formed in response to a 2009 tender by Oyu Tolgoi (OT) to design a Community Health, Safety and Security (CHSS) Program for communities most impacted by the development of the OT mine project
* KTKK has six partner organizations and 30 resource partners from the government, academia, the private sector, and civil society.
* KTKK remains open to new resource partners that could provide support to the partner organizations and contribute to CHSS program design.

**KTKK Core Partners**

* Pact Institute
* Public Health Institute
* JTA International
* Foundation for Health Policy Promotion
* EPOS Health Management
* Mongolian Centre for Development Studies

**KTKK Tasks: HIA and Activity Design**

**Phase I:** Conduct a Health impact assessment (HIA) that focuses on Health, Safety and Security and abides by international standards.

**Phase II:** Design a CHSS Program for the impact areas of the OT mine, based on the HIA results

**What is an HIA?**

As defined by the International Council on Mining and Metals (ICMM), a Health Impact Assessment is a systematic approach to predicting and managing the potential positive and negative health effects of policies, plans, programs and projects on local communities and the wider society (ICMM 2010).

The Oyu Tolgoi HIA will achieve this by applying the International Finance Corporation (IFC) Standards on Social and Environmental Sustainability (IFC 2006) and by taking account of relevant commitments and guidelines of Oyu Tolgoi and its owners, Ivanhoe Mines Mongolia Incorporated (IMMI) and Rio Tinto.

**HIA Steps: Approval**

KTKK developed a Mongolian-specific HIA approach, drawing from the IFC and ICMM standards and international experience of KTKK members.

KTKK’s methodology received *unanimous approval from the Public Health Institute’s Scientific Committee* on September 6th and subsequently was *approved by the Ethics Committee of the Ministry of Health* on October 6th.

**HIA Steps: Literature Review**

KTKK conducted a review of literature from existing studies, including:

* International and corporate social sustainability standards, including those for HIA
* Relevant Mongolian laws, policies and national standards
* Relevant GOM, civil society, donor and Oyu Tolgoi initiatives in the area
* Known information on health, safety and security issues in Umnugovi Aimag, including a comprehensive EIA and two SIAs

**HIA Steps: Field Research**

During Phase 1 of the consultancy, KTKK consults with community members, government officials, NGOs and the private sector through field research and consultation.

KTKK’s 12-member research team traveled to South Gobi aimag on October 10th and conducted field research in all four impact soums (Dalanzadgad, Bayan-Ovoo, Khanbogd, and Manlai), including:

**a) Health Resources Review**

**b) Key Informant Interviews**

**c) Focus Group Discussions**

**HIA Steps: Risk Analysis**

Informed by the literature review and field research, KTKK will next hold a Technical Expert Panel for Risk Analysis. Risks will be reviewed by experts and assessed according to Magnitude/Severity, Likelihood/Probability, and Overall Significance

**HIA Steps: Prioritized Mitigation Activities and Stakeholder Consultation**

Based on the significance ratings of the risk analysis by experts, priorities for ***Mitigation Activities*** will be defined and given shape.

KTKK will then ask its Stakeholder Advisory Committees (one in each of the impact soums), Focal Points at Ministries, Resource Partners, and other interested actors such as international donors to review the draft of ***Risks and Hazards*** and ***Mitigation Activities*** in order to refine it.

Once the refined list is available, KTKK will develop the top priority activities into the **Community Health, Safety, and Security Plan (CHSSP)**

**What is a CHSSP?**

A Community Health, Safety and Security (CHSS) program is a risk management plan.

Based on the findings of the HIA, KTKK will design a program for Oyu Tolgoi to implement that will mitigate the risks to CHSS identified by the HIA.

The CHSSP program may include activities such as:

* Public Awareness Campaigns
* Capacity building for HSS service providers
* Improved HSS service delivery mechanisms

The CHSSP will serve as a reference point for Oyu Tolgoi as well as others interested in health conditions in South Gobi

**Participation in the CHSSP Design**

The design process of the CHSSP will be participatory in nature and be founded in Mongolian ownership

KTKK is obtaining input from stakeholders during a workshop convened in Dalanzadgad, as well as from the field research and through consultations throughout the HIA and CHSSP design process.

For more information about the work of KTKK contact:

Dr. Odnoo Brown – Team Leader

[obrown@pactworld.org](mailto:obrown@pactworld.org)

99149656

David Jacobstein – Team Advisor

[djacobstein@pactworld.org](mailto:djacobstein@pactworld.org)

95050873

**Discussion and recommendations :**

* It is commendable that Oyu Tolgoi (OT) has created a vision and initiative for an innovative and far-reaching Community Health, Safety & Security Program (CHSSP) to minimize and mitigate health, safety, and security impacts of OT operations and to improve service delivery, capacity, and indicators in the target area, and complement and build upon existing Mongolian Government and OT activities and standards. Due to its scale and the nature of OT’s operations, the project will have a variety of direct and indirect socio-economic, environmental, health, safety, and security impacts on communities and stakeholders, including both positive and negative impacts.
* Linkages to national policies, programs and organizations should be considered to promote effective cooperation, coordination and synergies to ensure the sustainability of the activities in the framework of OT CHSSP.
* The Consortium resource partners are from Government, research academia, private sector and NGOs’ representations which is a quite good and complete combination of partners. But, it is recommended that Trade Union organizations should be included to protect the interests of the mine workers and their labour and social rights.
* Some estimations suggest that when the OT operations start, it will produce 10-30% of overall national GDP. The revenues paid by the OT Project will be paid to the central government, which may even reduce its contribution to the *aimag* and *soum* governments on the grounds that they will be receiving increased local tax revenues from OT. Therefore, there is a need for collaborative lobbying to the central government by the *aimag* and *soum* governments with assistance from OT and other major projects in the area, for an increased revenue allocation to the mining area governments from central coffers. It’s recommended that KTKK provides the scientific evidence through its field study reports and health impact assessment and CHSSP design and contribute to this lobbying.
* A participatory approach is good but it is important to use an appropriate and locally accepted approach for the organisation of stakeholders’ consultations. Posing and asking the right questions is important too, as it can be that answers are not conclusive because questions are not appropriate.

**End of recorded discussion.**